UNITED NATIONS

ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL

Distr. LIMITED

E/ECA/TEAM/[illegible]

[illegible] December 1[illegible]

ENGLISH

Original: FRENCH

ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR AFRICA

LC/NAIROBI.

[illegible] OF THE
SEMINAR ON DEMOGRAPHIC STATISTICS

Addis Ababa, (Ethiopia), 9-12 December 1[illegible]

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
A.	Introduction	1
B.	Attendance	1
C.	Opening	1
D.	Summary of the papers presented and Debates	3

Annexes

Annex I List of the Documents of the Seminar

Annex II Participants Evaluation of the Seminar

Annex III ECA's observations and the participants' impression of the seminar as a whole

A. INTRODUCTION

1. The seminar on tourism statistics organized jointly by the Economic Commission for Africa (ECA) and the World Tourism Organization (WTO) was held at Africa Hall, ECA Headquarters in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia from 8 to 12 December 1986.

B. ATTENDANCE

2. The seminar was attended by the representatives of the following countries: Burkina Faso, Cameroon, Cote d'Ivoire, Djibouti, Egypt, Ethiopia, Kenya, Mauritius, Rwanda, Tanzania, Togo, Uganda, Zaire and Zimbabwe. The Ghana delegation which arrived too late to participate in the deliberations was given the document of the seminar and informed of the result achieved by ECA.

C. OPENING

3. The opening ceremony was chaired by the Executive Secretary of ECA.

Opening Statement (Agenda item 1)

4. In his opening address the ECA Executive Secretary welcomed the participants and expressed satisfaction at the convening of the meeting. He said that this seminar, the first of its kind in Africa was the result of a close co-operation between WTO and ECA. He expressed the hope that such a co-operation would be beneficial to the member States of the two organizations.

5. The ECA Executive Secretary then went on to emphasize that tourism had become a vital sector in a large number of countries in the region not only on account of its significant contribution to job creation but also its impact on the development of many other sectors of activity including hotel management, trade in souvenir articles, transport and communications. He also mentioned the rapid growth recorded in the tourism sector over the last fifteen years, which led to hotel infrastructural development, so much so that the present accommodation capacity of a number of countries in the region was far from being fully utilized. That situation was often exacerbated by the seasonal and cyclical nature of the tourism industry and adversely affected the level of net income accruing from tourism activities.

6. As a result, the Executive Secretary went on, greater attention was being paid to the development analysis and planning of tourism supply and demand by government agencies and enterprises. Nevertheless, the statistical data available to them which should enable them to successfully accomplish their tasks were far from being complete, reliable, up to date and comparable from one country to another.

7. The Executive Secretary therefore, called on the participants to identify the major shortcomings in the existing statistics systems and the ways and means of correcting them by adopting as a framework of reference international recommendations on the methodology of tourism data collection, processing and analysis.

8. In conclusion, the Executive Secretary urged the participants to come up with concrete measures and wished them full success in their deliberations.

9. On behalf of the Secretary-General of the World Tourism Organization Mr. Willibald Pahr, the representative of this organisation began by thanking the ECA Executive Secretary, Professor Adebayo Adedeji for inviting them to participate in the organization of the seminar on National Tourism Administrations in Africa. He also welcomed all the participants to the seminar and wished them success in their deliberations.

10. He stated that on the whole, there was need for improving employment conditions for tourism statisticians, failing which they would not be motivated in making this profession a career. It was necessary to strengthen the tourism statistics services in the various African countries particularly through employment conditions similar to those of statisticians employed in other sectors.

11. Before concluding his statement the representative of WTO stated that the WTO Secretary-General would like to assure the ECA and the representatives of all the African States that the recommendations of this joint seminar would be given all the necessary attention and that his Organization would keep them informed accordingly through its policy-making bodies and its statistics committee.

12. The ECA Executive Secretary thanked the WTO representative for attending the seminar and expressed satisfaction at the co-operation between the two institutions. He then declared the seminar on Tourism Statistics open.

13. As proposed by the Leader of the Rwanda delegation, the following officers were elected:

Chairman - Egypt
Vice-Chairman- Kenya
Rapporteur - Cote d'Ivoire.

14. Mr. Abdel Rahman Salim, Leader of the Egyptian delegation on behalf of the officers thanked the participants for the confidence reposed in them.

15. The following agenda was adopted:

1. Opening of the seminar

(a) Welcome address by the ECA Executive Secretary

(b) Address by the representative of the World Tourism Organization

2. Election of Officers

3. Adoption of the agenda and organization of work

4. Report on the "importance of tourism statistics and the need to harmonize the collection, processing and dissemination of tourism statistical data in Africa", presented by ECA

5. Report on the processing of tourism statistics at international level with special reference to the World Tourism Organization.

6. Processing of tourism statistics at national level: "Methods of collection, processing and presenting tourism statistics", presented by ECA

7. Proposals and recommendations for the harmonization of tourism statistics in Africa to be submitted to the Conference of African Ministers of Tourism

8. Any other business

9. Adoption of the Report and closure of the seminar.

D. SUMMARY OF THE PAPERS PRESENTED AND DEBATES

Importance of tourism statistics and the need to harmonize their methods of collection, processing and dissemination in Africa (Agenda item IV)

16. Introducing document TRANSCOM/TOU/84/4 relating to this item an official of the ECA Secretariat recalled the need to provide statistical data not only to measure the importance of tourism in the economic life of a country, but also to determine tourism flows and make short, medium and long term projections. He emphasized, however, that most of the current national tourism statistics systems in the region were still far from fully accomplishing their mission on account of financial, material and human constraints.

17. He then went on to draw the balance sheet of tourism statistics development in Africa. In his opinion, the measurement of domestic tourism flow had hitherto not engaged the attention of the specialized services while international tourism statistics continued to fall mainly within the purview of administrative services. The data thus collected had serious flaws due mainly to their limited coverage, poor quality of statistics form and the incoherence in the classification concepts and systems used. They were generally supplemented by an estimation of tourist expenditure made within the framework of the preparation of the balance of payments. However, the reliability of such an estimation often became doubtful because of the mediocre nature of the data sources.

18. Lastly, the ECA Secretariat official said that in his opinion the gradual establishment of integrated national tourism statistics systems remained the only effective way of remedying the situation. The major steps to be taken in that direction should include the establishment of a central organ for the data collection, processing and dissemination, the publication of a national directory of accommodation establishments, the harmonization of basic concepts and classification systems, the definition of a method for systematic and rational utilization of tourism statistics and their centralization in a data bank accessible to all users. Efforts aimed at ensuring gradual establishment of integrated national tourism statistics systems should not be confined to the improvement data collected by administrative services. These efforts should also be directed towards the formulation of programmes for periodic surveys, pursuant to international directives.

"Tourism statistics in Africa" document No. STAT/CBS/AF/1 presented by WTO

19. In his introduction, the representative of WTO first emphasised the usefulness of tourism statistics in African countries particularly to:

(a) enable policy-making bodies to determine levels of tourism demand and supply,

(b) facilitate the assessment of costs and socio-economic benefits of tourism at the level of the various countries and,

(c) assist planners of the public and private sectors to plan on short and medium term basis so as to maximise tourism benefits in African countries.

20. He also emphasized the need to attain a higher degree of standardisation of tourism statistics in the African region as far as the coverage of data, concepts and definitions were concerned ;

21. In order to improve the scope, level and quality of tourism statistics of African countries, the representative of WTO recommended the implementation of certain number of short and medium term objectives including the following specific actions:

(a) conduct of surveys on the expenses of visitors to supplement the data supplied by the Central Bank and better still to assess the economic impact of tourism in the African countries ;

(b) more rapid publication of tourism statistics;

(c) publication of tourism statistics directory by each country;

(d) adoption and application of international definitions and classifications in tourism statistics recommended by WTO

(e) improved system of collection, processing, analysis and presentation of tourism statistics particularly through the use of computers.

22. The presentation of the two reports was followed by statements by delegations on their national experiences in the collection, processing and presentation of tourism statistics.

23. It emerged from these statements that in most countries, there was the real need for reliable, comparable and regular statistical data so as to better grasp the overall tourism activities and to provide the various users and decision-makers with information on the actual contribution of tourism to the economic, social and cultural development of the countries.

The delegations deplored the fact that domestic tourism statistics did not often cover all tourism activities and the tools used were ineffective and that the delays in their presentation reduced their operational impacts. In most cases, the resources were clearly inadequate in relation to the role the bodies in charge of tourism statistics were to play at national level.

24. The delegations observed that there was the need to establish the necessary technical instruments for the accomplishment of their task. They therefore hoped the deliberations of the seminar would provide such instruments.

DISCUSSIONS

25. Some delegates asked for clarifications on the specific points in the different reports, to which appropriate replies were given by the two speakers.

26. Emphasis was placed on the importance of tourism indicators as vital tools for determining the usefulness of tourism in the economic life of countries, manpower and environment. It was necessary to clearly define these indicators, which could be the subject of another seminar. It would also be advisable that a meeting be held on the costs and benefits of tourism as well as the methods of analysing cases of indicators.

Participants approved the two documents submitted, the main points of which may be summed up as follows:

(a) establishment of statistical data banks at national and international levels;

(b) creation of a central directory on accommodation establishments and tourism enterprises;

(c) harmonisation of basic concepts. The need to implement a periodic survey programme at national level to supplement the basic data was also highlighted.

Agenda Item 5

(a) "Definitions and classifications" Document No. STAT/CEI/AF/2 presented by WTO.

27. The representative of WTO spoke on the criteria and the meaning of the definitions and classifications recommended by the Organisation in national and international tourism statistics. He therefore insisted on the need to harmonise the concepts, definitions and classifications of tourism statistics with those used by other international organisations in their respective areas of competence particularly with regard to international migrations, balance of payments and national accounting. The realisation of such a programme may be possible through cooperation between ECA, ILO and WTO. Besides, it was noted that although there existed the need to harmonise and standardise the methods, the size of the continent, the different cultural and technological levels as well as differences between the levels of development and the types of administrative, political and social organisations should be taken into consideration. Therefore, national development according to specific cases could be undertaken. However, these different experiences should help ensure global progress and promote cooperation.

DISCUSSIONS

28. During the discussions that followed the presentation of the report, the representatives of WTO and ECA provided clarifications.

It should be noted from the discussions

(a) that the classifications provided in the report were provisional whereas the definitions had gained international consensus. In view of the aforementioned, the classifications could be modified to take into account national requirements; the meanings in each case should be given in explanatory notes;

(b) that the basic concept presently adopted was the term "visitor" and that preference was given to "night of stay" in relation to the notion of "24" hours to indicate the minimum stay required; preference would also be given to classification according to "residence" instead of "nationality" as far as tourism statistics were concerned;

(c) With regard to the African region, classification of countries into sub-regions should take into account ECA classification, namely, MULPOC:

1. Tangiers MULPOC (North Africa)
Algeria, Egypt, Libya, Morocco, Tunisia, the Sudan;

2. Niamey MULPOC (West Africa)
Burkina Faso, Cape Verde, Cote d'Ivoire, The Gambia, Ghana, Guinea, Guinea Bissau, Liberia, Mali, Mauritania, Niger, Nigeria, Senegal, Sierra Leone, Togo;

3. Yaounde MULPOC (Central Africa)
Cameroon, The Congo, Gabon, Equatorial Guinea, Central African Republic, Sao Tome et Principe, Chad ;

4. Gisenyi MULPOC (Great Lakes Region)
Burundi, Rwanda, Zaire;

5. Lusaka MULPOC (Eastern and Southern Africa)
Angola, Botswana, The Comoros, Djibouti, Mauritius, Ethiopia, Kenya, Lesotho, Madagascar, Malawi, Mozambique, Uganda, Tanzania, Swaziland, Zambia, Zimbabwe.

The most important thing is that after the regrouping, a list should be prepared indicating member States belonging to each group.

(d) Establishment in member States of national statistics committees in charge of integrating the various types of statistics and methods of collection, processing, and presentation of statistics at national level

Embarkation/Disembarkation Cards as Source of Tourism Statistics (Document STAT/CEI/AF/3) (presented by WTO)

29. In his statement, the representative of WTO first recommended the use as wide as possible of embarkation/disembarkation cards by countries of the African region because the cards provided a relatively full coverage since all visitors had to complete them. At the moment, there were several versions of embarkation/disembarkation cards used in the Africa region. In order to separate the arrivals of visitors from arrivals of other categories of travellers not included in tourism statistics, embarkation/disembarkation cards should provide information on country of residence, purpose of visit and length of stay. There should be a greater coordination between the national tourism administration, immigration service, Civil Aviation and the Central Bureau of Statistics with regard to the processing of embarkation/disembarkation cards.

DISCUSSIONS

30. Discussions that followed the presentation of this document showed that it was necessary to have as much as possible standard model of card, and adaptations could be made according to national needs and requirements. The draft presented by WTO should at any rate not only be approved by tourism authorities but also be the subject of agreement by other administrations and bodies concerned with the movement of persons.

31. Embarkation/disembarkation cards constitute the main if not the only source of information on the movements of persons across the frontiers. It is important therefore that they should be used to collect tourism statistical data. It emerged from the exchange of views on the paper presented by WTO and the models currently used in African States that:

(a) The use of embarkation/disembarkation cards should not only be maintained but should as much as possible serve to determine the movements of tourists for all modes of transport;

(b) The cards should provide information on the place of residence (where the traveller has lived for one year), the main purpose of travel, (see classification) and the length of stay;

(c) written instructions should be given to border control officers on the model of cards proposed by WTO

Accommodation Statistics (STAT/CEI/AF/4

32. Introducing this document, the representative of WTO first pointed out that statistics to be collected from accommodation establishments could inter alia help:

(a) to measure the frequency and utilisation as well as seasonal variation of places offered in the hotels;

(b) establish the relationship between demand and supply in terms of accommodation and determine the occupancy rate according to regions of the country and types and categories of the establishments

33. He then enumerated a number of basic conditions which should be fullfiled so as to obtain qualitative statistical data, namely:

(a) the enactment of a legislation which would compel hotel managements to keep a register of their guests and the authorities to ensure the compliance of such a legislation;

(b) collection of data at the time of arrival of each guest, which should be transferred daily into registers;

(c) daily recording of the departure of guests;

(d) ensure that an employee of the hotel transfer each day the date from the register into the form.

34. For the surveys at the hotels to be effective, it was necessary that each country have a complete and up-to-date directory on accommodation establishments. A standard form should be used for data collection at the hotels to facilitate accurate completion of the form. Instructions for the completion of the form should specify two areas: definitions and norms for the transfer of the data which should in turn indicate two groups of general norms and specific norms for completing the form. These norms should be reproduced in an instructions manual placed at the disposal of the hotel managements.

35. It was decided that this report be compared with the one presented by ECA on agenda item 6 whose texts were to a large extent similar.

Report of the methods of collection, processing and presentation of tourism statistics in Africa (presented by ECA). (Agenda item 6)

36. After dealing with the definition of certain basis concepts, the rapporteur expatiated on the collection, processing and presentation of tourism statistics in African at national level. He also submitted for adoption by participants, the format of the tourism statistics directory to be published by member States. Models of tables were attached to this report which was then presented for comments from participants.

37. During the discussion that followed the presentation of this report, it was decided that document ECA/TEM/AF/2 "Definitions and classifications" presented by WTO should be integrated into the chapter of the ECA report dealing with definition of concepts. In that connection, it was recommended that member States which would include students in tourism flow should mention that in their publications.

38. The model of embarkation/disembarkation card presented by WTO could be completed with information on modes of transport. However, the signing of these cards as well as the accommodation used by the visitors were left at the discretion of states until the need arose for information as to whether or not the tourist used commercial establishments.

39. Furthermore, it was recommended that member States should publish annually the tourism statistics directory, of which the list of basic tables was adopted as follows:

I. Tourism offer

(a) Total accommodation capacity (room/bed);

(b) Sampling survey accommodation capacity;

(c) Accommodation capacity according to Administrative region/province;

(d) Accommodation capacity (room/bed) according to category of accommodation establishment;

(e) Evolution of accommodation capacity over the last three years.

II. Tourism demand: arrivals

(i) Frontiers;

(a) Global monthly arrivals at accommodation establishments and for all modes of transport;

(b) Global arrivals at frontiers according to purpose of travel;

(c) Global arrivals at frontiers according to mode of transport;

(d) Annual arrivals of non-residents according to country of residence;

(e) Monthly arrivals of non-residents according to country of residence;

(ii) Accommodation

(a) Monthly arrivals of non-residents in tourist accommodation establishments;

(b) Global arrivals of tourists in all accommodation establishments of the country;

(c) Monthly arrivals of residents in provinces;

(d) Monthly arrivals of residents according to type of accommodation establishments;

(e) Monthly arrival of non-residents according to type of accommodation establishments;

(f) Global monthly arrivals according to region/province;
Global arrivals according to type of tourist in the country as a whole;
Arrivals of residents according to type of hotel and mode of transport;
Arrivals of non-residents according to type of hotel and mode of transport;

(g) Arrivals according type of hotel and mode;
Global arrivals according to type of hotel and mode of transport;

(h) Arrivals according to purpose of travel and mode of transport;
Arrivals of non-residents according to purpose of travel and mode of transport;
Arrivals of residents according to purpose of travel and mode of transport;

(i) Seasonal nature of international tourism;

(j) Distribution of global arrivals according to tourism region .

III. Overnight stays

(a) Global monthly nights of stay in accommodation establishments;

(b) Global nights of stay by non-residents according to country of residence;

(c) Monthly nights of stay by non-residents according to country of residence;
Monthly nights of stay by non-residents according to country of residence and type of hotel accommodation;
Global nights of stay by residents in accommodation establishments and according to administrative region;

(d) Characteristics of international tourism according to generating markets;

(e) Monthly nights of stay by non-residents;

(f) Distribution of global nights of stay according to tourism region;

(g) Nights of stay according to category of tourism establishments;

(h) Nights of stay according to category of hotel accommodation and mode of transport;

(i) Nights of stay according to purposes of travel and mode of transport

IV. Occupancy ratio

(a) Monthly occupancy ratio according to room/bed in tourist accommodation establishments;

(b) Monthly occupancy ratio according to category of accommodation establishments;

(c) Occupancy ratio according to bedroom/beds and tourist category;

(d) Occupancy ratio according to rooms and beds and tourism region

V. Length of stay

(a) Average length of stay for all the tourists in the commercial accommodation establishments;
Average length of stay covering all the tourists throughout the country;

(b) Average length of stay of non-residents in the country;
Average length of stay of non-residents in commercial accommodation establishments;

(c) Average length of stay of non-residents according to country of residence;

(d) Average length of stay for all tourists;

(e) Average monthly length of stay of non-residents according to country of residence;

(f) Length of stay according to tourist region.

VI. Economic data on hotel industry

(a) Gross income in foreign currency from international tourism;

(b) Monthly distribution of international tourism income according to region;

(c) Employment per region and per category of lodging establishment;

(d) Salaries allocated by tourism (hotel trade, travel agencies);

(e) Salaries paid to expatriates.

These tables would be prepared on the basis of available data on the questions completed by accommodation establishments (hotel statistics) and information collected from frontier control statistics. It was recommended that instead of classification according to country of residence, preference should be given to classification according to nationality. However in view of national peculiarities, the two tables could be prepared.

40. Delegations hoped that other methods for data collection on tourist movement, namely sample surveys and different methods of survey would be the subject of meetings to be convened as early as possible so as provide member States with effective instruments for assessing the contribution of tourism to the economic, cultural and social development of countries.

41. It was also proposed that member States should take steps to introduce legislation and regulations to ensure that tourism activities provide the information required for the compilation of tourism statistics.

Proposals and recommendations to be submitted to the Conference of African Ministers of Tourism (Agenda Item 2)

42. The last session was devoted to the finalisation and adoption of proposals and recommendations to be submitted to the next session of the Conference of African Ministers of Tourism.

43. Participants adopted the reports submitted during the seminar as amended in the light of observations made during the deliberations.

44. With regard to document TRAVCOM/TRU/86/3 relating to the compilation, processing and presentation of domestic tourism statistics, it was decided that before its distribution to member States the following should be incorporated:

(a) inclusion of definitions contained in the report STAT/CRT/AF/2;

(b) revision of the list of the different tables to be prepared by member States;

(c) inclusion of the recommendations and amendments proposed by participants, so that the final formulations could be sent to member States.

45. Besides, delegations emphasized the need to ensure a wide dissemination of the results of the seminar among member States including those which did not attend.

The following recommendations were adopted:

(i) It is desirable that there should be close co-operation among the authorities responsible for the application of methods for the collection, processing and dissemination of border control statistics and the authorities responsible for the development of tourism in the States. Besides, appropriate technical training should be given to immigration, police and customs officers to enable them to better grasp tourism statistics through the introduction of on-the-job tourism statistics courses. In this regard, National Tourism Administrations should alert the services concerned to the importance and objectives of tourism statistics as well as the need to have relevant information on the movement of tourists.

(ii) It is recommended that member States collect information on the arrival and departure of visitors at all frontier posts through the use of a standard embarkation/disembarkation card which provides, in addition to the information required by the immigration services, data on the movement of tourists, namely:

- country of residence;
- length of stay;
- mode of transport;
- purpose of visit and, where necessary;
- use of commercial accommodation.

(iii) National Tourism Administrations should publish annually a statistics directory containing information on tourism supply and demand, accommodation, length of stay, occupancy rate, economic activity of hotels and tourism industry and the human resources of the tourism sector. In this connection, a minimum list of tables to be included in these directories was adopted.

(iv) Professional training programmes for statistics staff should be implemented at national level. In this regard, the existing training facilities could be used such as the universities, statistics bureaux, municipal centres and other national training institutions. ECA, WTO and any other organisation engaged in tourism activity are called upon to take the necessary steps which will enable member States to benefit from their experiences in tourism statistics and to systematically impart their technical knowledge in the form of manuals, studies etc... in the collection, processing and dissemination of tourism statistics.

(v) As part of the harmonization of the methods for the collection, processing and dissemination, the following measures should be taken:

- Creation of a central body responsible for tourism statistics at national level;

- Publication of a central directory on accommodation establishments;

- Harmonization of basic concepts, definitions and systems of classification used within the framework of data collection;

- Implementation of periodic survey programmes to supplement the basic data;

- Formulation of a method for systematic and rational utilisation of tourism statistics and their centralization in a data bank accessible to all the users.

(vi) National Tourism Administrations should endeavour to ensure the preparation and regular publication of tourism statistical tables.

(vii) African tourism statistics experts should insist on the need for the adoption by member States of harmonized concepts and systems of classification.

(viii) ECA and WTO should assist States to set up the required mechanism for the collection, processing and dissemination of tourism statistics which should cover hotel statistics and frontier arrivals, tourism income and expenditure.

(ix) ECA and WTO in close co-operation with subregional intergovernmental organizations should organize as early as possible a technical seminar on the methods of processing tourism statistical data for the benefit of African statistics staff. These seminars should be organized at the subregional level.

(x) ECA and WTO should consider the possibilities of undertaking technical assistance missions in the field of tourism statistics to States which so request.

(xi) Legal measures should be taken at national level to compel as large a number as possible of accommodation establishments to keep registers of guests as well as any document necessary for the preparation of the tourism statistical directory and similar publications. These measures should apply to all commercial accommodation establishments.

In order to ensure integration and comparability of the data collected from the establishments, it is recommended that a standard model of hotel registration card should be adopted.

(xii) It is recommended that co-operation among various agencies of the United Nations family such as the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), the International Labour Organization (ILO), and ECA together with the World Tourism Organization help member States set up operational tourism statistics and scientific research systems necessary for harmonious and effective development of the tourism sector.

Following the adoption of the recommendations and the report of the seminar (agenda item 9), the Chairman expressed satisfaction at the quality of the documents and the high level of participation as well as the concrete results obtained.

He congratulated the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa for organizing the first seminar in Africa on the collection, processing and presentation of tourism statistics. He expressed the hope that those items that could not be examined would be considered in a very near future during seminars sponsored not only by ECA and WTO but also by other international institutions and organizations.

The Chairman also expressed satisfaction at the fruitful co-operation between WTO and ECA and hoped that it would be further strengthened for the benefit of the member States. He availed himself of the opportunity to congratulate the two organizations on the quality of the reports presented.

The ECA Representative thanked the participants for their contribution to the success of the seminar and reiterated ECA's readiness to do everything possible to give tourism the place it deserved in the economic, social and cultural development of Africa.

ECA would leave no stone unturned for the tourism industry to be provided with the necessary human and technical resources for its development to the benefit of the African populations.

The Representative of WTO for his part reiterated his organization's genuine desire to strengthen co-operation between WTO and ECA in order to make their resources available to African states. He also expressed satisfaction at the good relations between WTO and ECA and the quality of the work as well as the results obtained.

Before the Chairman declared the seminar closed, the ECA secretariat commented on the participants' impression of the seminar, which was generally positive as reflected in Annex IV.

ANNEX I

LIST OF THE DOCUMENTS OF THE SEMINAR

ECA Documents

TRANSCOM/TPU/88/3 - Methods of collection, processing and presentation of tourism statistics.

TRANSCOM/TPU/88/4 - Importance of tourism statistics and the need to harmonize their methods of collection, processing and dissemination in Africa.

WTO Documents

STAT/SEM/AF/1 - Tourism statistics in Africa

STAT/SEM/AF/2 - Definitions and classifications

STAT/SEM/AF/3 - Embarkation/Disembarkation Cards as source of Tourism Statistics.

STAT/SEM/AF/4 - Accommodation statistics

ANNEX II

PARTICIPANTS' EVALUATION OF THE SEMINAR

A questionnaire for the evaluation of the seminar was handed to participants. All delegations kindly accepted to answer the questions on the questionnaire. In some cases, the questionnaires were filled in by various participants of the same delegation.

Here are the answers and comments furnished:

1. Duration of seminar

Almost all participants felt that the duration of the seminar was either suitable or too short.

It is advisable that a seminar of this nature should last for at most one or two weeks.

2. Daily programme of work

Generally, participants felt that the daily programme of work was too full. This opinion is certainly related to the seminar's duration being considered too short.

3. Content of the seminar compared with what was expected

All answers were favourable but then at various degrees. Most participants felt that the seminar sufficently or largely met their expectations.

This is a very good result especially if we consider that the seminar was the first of its kind.

4. General level of the seminar

All participants, with the exception of two with contrary views, considered the general level of the seminar appropriate. When account is taken of the topic discussed, tourism data which, essentially, present a practical and methodical aspect, it can be said that we are very satisfied with this overall impression.

5. Interest resulting from topics discussed

Half of the participants found all topics discussed interesting. Some topics drew particular attention, notably:

- hotel data
- data gathering
- definitions

6. Undiscussed or insufficiently discussed topics:

Some participants felt that certain topics were undiscussed or insufficiently discussed.

The participants made several interesting suggestions. These suggestions dealt with points which should necessarily lead to studies, further studies and subsequent meetings.

7. Suggestions to improve the seminar

Participants made many proposals relating to the preparation and presentation of documents, the conduct of debates.

ECA will certainly consider these proposals in the preparation and organization of future seminars.

8. Length of papers, debates and visits

A few pertinent remarks were made on the following points:

- papers, generally, too long;
- time allotted to debates, too short;
- no organized visits.

For sure, the keen interest in topics discussed called for exhaustive papers. This perforce limited the time allotted to debates.

Since discussion of these topics was compulsory, the general complaint was that the duration of the seminar was too short.

ECA has taken note of the need to organize visits during seminars.

9. General level of papers

All participants considered the general level of papers presented good or excellent. This opinion applied to :

- the presentation of papers by lecturers

- the ability of lecturers to discuss the subjects

10. Relations between participants and lecturers

The exchange of views was good between participants and:

- the lecturers and leaders of debates ;

- fellow participants.

This assessment makes it possible to appraise the homogeneity of the group of participants. This is indeed fundamental to the interest in and the effectiveness of a seminar.

11. Usefulness of the seminar at the professional level

Participants answered this question very favourably. This portrays their high degree of professionalism.

12. Application of knowledge acquired during the seminar

Nearly all participants were ready to apply the knowledge acquired during the seminar which, in the final analysis was very useful.

13. Need to organize another seminar on the same topics.

The answer is in the affirmative if the objective is to organize similar seminars in each country. The answer furnished, notwithstanding the interest to organize seminars locally, is significant as there is a very great need to divulge and train.

14. Aspects uncovered by the seminar

Many good suggestions were made on this point. ECA will consider them in programming its future activities.

In conclusion, participants felt thatdespite a few hitches, the seminar was interesting and useful. They stated their readiness to apply lessons from the seminar. It can therefore be said that the objective set for the seminar was finally achieved.

ANNEX III

ECA'S OBSERVATIONS AND THE PARTICIPANTS' IMPRESSION ON THE SEMINAR AS A WHOLE

1. Attendance

The number of participants of the seminar was quite large. Thirteen (13) countries were represented to which should be added a fourteenth country which arrived late in Addis Ababa. Participants formed a homogeneous group composed of tourism experts imbued with a great sense of duty and progress.

2. Preparation

The delegates carefully prepared their participation in the seminar. They gave an account of the tourism situation in their countries. They made comments on the documents they received.

3. Contribution

Discussions have been lively throughout the seminar. All the participants should be commended for their frankness and spontaneity during the discussions and for their concern for improvement in the documents submitted to them.

4. Recommendations

The recommendations made were timely and relevant. They no doubt helped resolve many problems and make in-roads in the various areas of tourism statistics.

5. General impression

This first seminar on tourism statistics has at last attained some of the objectives set. However, it cannot be claimed that all the problems have been resolved.

The essential thing is that the course has been carted and that each and everyone is determined to forge ahead.

ANNEXE IV

LISTE DES PARTICIPANTS / LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

BURKINA FASO	M. ZOUNGRANA BI DENIS Conseiller des Affaires Economiques
CAMEROUN/CAMEROON	M. DACLEU ANATOLE Chef de service Adjoint des Statistiques au Secrétariat d'Etat au Tourisme
COTE D'IVOIRE	M. KEITA SALIA Conseiller Technique Ministère du Tourisme
	M. KOUIDE ROBERT Sous-Directeur des statistiques
DJIBOUTI	M. FARAH SAID ELMI Directeur Adjoint à l'Office National du Tourisme et de l'Artisanat
EGYPT	M. ABDEL RAHMAN SELIM Under-Secretary of State for Tourism Ministry of Tourism
	Mrs. FAYZA MAHMOUD HAMMA First Specialist Statistics Department of Research and Training Ministry of Tourism
	M. MEDHAT EL-KADY Consulleraf the Egyptian Embassy

ANNEXE IV

ETHIOPIE/ETHIOPIA	Dr. THEODROS ATLABACHEW Head Planning Service
	M. HABTE W/GIORGIS Statistician
	M. HABTYESUS BEKELE Research and Statistics Head
	M. ABRAHAM ZEMARIAM Asst. Planning Expert
KENYA	M. E.G.O. OLALI Principal Planning Officer Head of Planning Division Ministry of Tourism and Wildlife
	M. AMATA ENDEKW.. J.B. Senior Economist/Statistician Ministry of Tourism and Wildlife
ILE MAURICE/MAURITIUS	M. S. SADAFUL Statistician Ministry of Employment and Tourism
RWANDA	M. SISI JEAN DAMASCENE Chef de Section Etudes et Programmes, Office Rwandais du Tourisme et des Parcs Nationaux
	M. REKERAHO ANASTASE Fonctionnaire Atteché à la Section Etudes et Programmes Office Rwandais du Tourisme et des Parcs Nationaux
TANZANIE/TANZANIA	Miss. UZEELI M. MFINANGA Tourist Officer Ministry of Tourism and Natural Resources
	Miss. SCHOLASTICA RUHINDA Acting Research Manager Tanzania Tourist Corporation
TOGO	M. NISSAWOU B. NAPO Responsable du bureau des statistiques Direction du Tourisme

OUGANDA/UGANDA	M. DAVID ABUKA OGWANG Economist Ministry of Tourism
ZAIRE	Citoyen YUMAINE ALI MUAMBNA Directeur Etudes et Documentation de l'Office National du Tourisme
ZIMBABWE	M. SHEPERD NYAPUWATA Research and Planning Manager
GHANA	M. TETTEH QUAYNOR Research and Development Manager
	M. E.Y. SARPONG KUMANKOMAH Acting regional manager of the Tourist Board.

ORGANISATIONS/ORGANIZATIONS

ORGANISATION MONDIALE DU TOURISME/ WORLD TOURISM ORGANIZATION	M. PACI ENZO Chief Statistics Section

SECRETARIAT CEA/ECA SECRETARIAT

TRANSPORT, COMMUNICATIONS AND TOURISM DIVISION	M. M. BONGOY Chief, Transport, Communications and Tourism Division
	M. F. W. RUTAIWA Chief, Transport and Tourism Section
	M. F. SAKO Economic Affairs Officer
	M. J. SOLIS Railway Expert
STATISTICS DIVISION	M.K.T. DE GRAFT JOHNSON Chief, Statistics Division
	M.K. AMELEWONOU General Economics Statistics Section.

UNITED NATIONS

ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL

Distr.: LIMITED

E/ECA/TRANS/48
6 March 1987

ENGLISH
Original: FRENCH

ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR AFRICA

LC/NAIROBI

REPORT OF THE THIRD MEETING OF THE REGIONAL TECHNICAL COMMITTEE ON AIR TRANSPORT IN AFRICA

(Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, 2-5 March 1987)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
A.	ORGANIZATION OF WORK	1
B.	PARTICIPATION	1
C.	OPENING OF THE MEETING	2
D.	ACCOUNT OF PROCEEDINGS	4

A. ORGANIZATION OF WORK

1. The third meeting of the Technical Committee on Air Transport in Africa, set up under the Mbabane Declaration on air transport in Africa, met from 2 to 5 March 1987, in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, at the headquarters of the Economic Commission for Africa (ECA).

B. PARTICIPATION:

2. The following members were present:

Representatives of Civil Aviation Administrations

- Mr. J.N. Kabuki, representing the East African region.
- Mr. Mbala, representing the Central African region.
- Mr. A. Daoudi, representing the North African region.
- Mr. Patrick Ndlovu, representing the Southern African region.

Representatives of Airlines

- Mr. V.J. Gbaguidi, representing the West African region.
- Mr. N. Ragheb, assisted by Mr. Mohamed Talaat Ahmed-Ibrahim, representing the North African region.
- Mr. Bekele Wolde, representing the East African region.
- Mr. Arthur Mimonga Michaels, representing the Southern African region.

Representatives of international organizations

ECA: Messrs: M. Bongov
F. Rutaiva
A. Virag
P. Mangosela
H. Koumare
J. Solis

OAU: Messrs. Y.C. Afanou, Head
Transport and Communications Division

E.A. Chimwaza, Transport Economist

AFCAC: Mr. E. Lomboulou, Secretary-General

The following members were unable to attend:

- Mr. L.C. Okonkwo, representative of civil aviation administrations of the West African region.

- Mr. F. Banga, representative of airlines of the Central African region.

- Mr. M.E.B. Zarrong, AFRAA representative.

OBSERVERS

- Mr. Diallo Seydi, First Secretary, Embassy of Guinea, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

- Mrs. Mapia Manwla Lucas, Embassy of Mozambique, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

C. OPENING OF THE MEETING

3. The Chairman opened the meeting and then gave the floor to the representatives of the Executive Secretary of ECA and the Secretary-General of the OAU.

4. The opening statement of the Executive Secretary of ECA was read on his behalf by his Special Assistant, Mr. Jeggan Senghor. In it he welcomed the members of the Committee and recalled the importance that he had always attached to air transport matters culminating in the material assistance that ECA was providing to the Committee.

5. The third meeting was singularly important as it immediately preceded the tenth meeting of the Inter-Agency Co-ordinating Committee for UNTACDA (IACC). The latter body was busy taking stock of the impact of the transport and communications Decade in Africa as the Decade was drawing to a close. The report of the Committee's third meeting would be forwarded to the tenth IACC. The Committee's third meeting was also important because all African bodies were embarking on programmes to deal with the economic crisis which was afflicting the continent.

6. Although some people still harboured a prejudice against air transport because they considered it a preserve of the privileged few, such an attitude was a short-sighted one and the Committee should not allow itself to be deflected from its task by such scepticisms.

7. The Executive Secretary then went on to highlight the various items on the agenda and exhorted the Committee to turn its attention seriously to them as Africa was expecting concrete results from its work and not another report that would be filed away.

8. The Secretary-General of the OAU could also not be present and Mr. Dirar, Director of EDECO made a statement on his behalf.

9. Mr. Dirar pointed out that the third meeting of the Committee was taking place within the context of the adoption of the African Priority Programme for Economic Recovery and thus was of great significance since air transport was a major instrument for integrating the transport system in Africa and for the physical and socio-ecomic integration of the continent. The OAU, therefore, attached great importance to the activities of the Committee which is charged with co-ordinating virtually all major activities of air transport in Africa.

10. It was gratifying to note that the Committee would grapple with the problems associated with the granting of third, fourth and fifth freedoms of the air. In that regard, it was worth recalling that the problems encountered in the granting of full traffic rights had been discussed in various fora including the sub-committee on Air Transport and Civil Aviation which was convened in Addis Ababa by the OAU in November 1970 as directed by the Sixth Summit of East and Central African States which was held in Khartoum in January 1970. Another matter of importance to be discussed by the Committee was the creation of a single pan-African airline as advocated in the Lagos Plan of Action and the Final Act of Lagos. Such a pan-African airline would have to be preceded by several multinational airlines for whose formation a careful study was necessary in order to analyse the difficulties experienced in the past by subregional airlines.

He concluded by wishing the committee fruitful discussions.

11. The Chairman, for his part, welcomed the Committee members and thanked ECA and OAU for the active part they have played in promoting the development of transport in Africa. He also thanked the Government and people of Socialist Ethiopia for the warm welcome accorded the participants since their arrival in Addis Ababa.

12. He summarized the Committee's terms of reference as dealing with freedoms of the air, air transport co-operation, facilitation and, last, a pan-African airline. Having thus drawn a broad picture of areas in which the Committee's work was expected to yield concrete results he went on to take stock of what had hitherto been achieved, particularly with regard to freedoms of the air and air transport co-operation. With regard to the former, the Committee had endorsed the policy adopted by African States under the auspices of AFCAC to solve problems associated with the granting of third, fourth and fifth freedom traffic rights. Financial resources, however, were needed for the Committee to be able to monitor the implementation of the adopted policy and it was, therefore, heartening to note that ECA would have, in its budget, provisions for facilitating the work of the Committee.

13. As regards air transport co-operation, the Chairman pointed to the close liaison between AFCAC and the Committee on the establishment of the African Civil Aviation Information System (AFCAIS) and the fact that, on the urging of the Committee, scheduling meetings among airlines before every traffic season were now a regular feature.

14. In conclusion, he noted with satisfaction, that the efforts of the Committee and those of other organizations concerned with air transport such as OAU, ECA, AFCAC and AFRAA were beginning to bear fruit as evidenced by the gradually increasing air connections in Africa.

D. ACCOUNT OF PROCEEDINGS

Adoption of the agenda (agenda item 2)

15. Following discussions on the need to maintain the agenda item relating to the policy-statement on air transport in Africa that AFRAA had to prepare, the committee adopted the following agenda:

1. Opening of the meeting
2. Adoption of the agenda and organization of work
3. Difficulties encountered during the exchange of the third, fourth and fifth freedoms of the air
4. Problems to be solved prior to the creation of subregional airlines
5. ECA/World Bank/UNDP project on transport development south of the Sahara
6. Planning of the technical committee s activities, taking into account objectives of the Mbabane Declaration
7. Draft policy-statement on air transport in Africa
8. Other business
9. Date and venue of the next meeting
10. Adoption of the report and closure of the meeting.

Difficulties encountered during the exchange of the third, fourth and fifth freedoms of the air (agenda item 3)

16. The AFCAC representative introduced document DEC/TRANSCOM/AIR/83 relating to traffic rights in Africa. In his paper, he highlighted the special attention that AFCAC has always paid to traffic rights. Traffic rights are exchanged in Africa like in other regions of the world through bilateral agreements on air transport. AFCAC has always recommended a policy to liberalize the exchange of the first and second freedoms of the air among member States. Moreover, African States, generally, lay emphasis on the exchange and development of the third and fourth freedoms of the air and adopt a policy to protect the fifth freedom.

17. The 1944 Chicago Conference obtained only partial results on multi-lateralism because an agreement (transit agreement) exists only on the first and second freedoms. Efforts subsequently made to win general acceptance of other commercial freedoms for scheduled air services, were not successful.

18. In Africa, at the moment, there is a move to harmonize the policy on traffic rights among the various countries. Surely, bilateralism will be preferred to multi-lateralism still for a while. Whatever the situation, AFCAC has prepared the following two drafts to be submitted to the committee for advisory opinion before consideration by its tenth plenary sitting:.

- Memorandum of understanding

- Multi-lateral air transport agreement among African States.

Debate

19. Discussions following the introduction of document DEC/TRANSCOM/AIR/23, centred on general remarks and on an analysis of both instruments (model memorandum of understanding and model multilateral air transport agreement among African States) appended to the document presented by AFCAC.

1. General remarks

20. It was stated that traffic rights are vital to the development of air services, and that, as a result, problems relating to granting them should be tackled with much flexibility. It was later stated that since the third and fourth freedoms of the air rights constitute fundamental rights, they should not form the subject of a commercial agreement and that there is no need to limit frequencies.

21. As regards the fifth freedom, it was said that air transport can only develop when a much more flexibile policy is adopted since air transport is, currently, undergoing profound changes, particularly, since 1985. Another representative stated that the proposed model memorandum does not provide, as far as the fifth freedom is concerned, for the case where reciprocity exists.

22. The committee's attention was drawn to its duty to make the actions concrete and on this score, it was felt that general framework would not meet the committee's set objectives.

23. Following this exchange of views, the Chairman concluded that there was an obvious need to present both documents and that the memorandum of understanding would provide an intermediary solution for bilateral agreements which can be realized immediately while awaiting the multilateral agreement which can be envisaged only on the long term.

2. Consideration of the memorandum of understanding

24. The main remarks made were on the following paragraphs:

Paragraph 1: The committee exchanged viewpoints on the need to specify in the memorandum the initial number of weekly frequencies. After lengthy discussions which revealed the advantages and disadvantages of maintaining a minimum service of two or three frequencies in the text, the committee concluded that paragraph 1 be recast, taking account of the following remarks:

- delete the word "simultaneously"

- allow the parties concerned to determine the minimum number of initial frequencies.

Paragraph 3

25. After an exchange of views on the notion of an equivalent global capacity which according to some members, does not favour the development of air services, the committee resolved that no amendment was necessary.

Paragraph 4

26. The committee considered the need to completely delete this paragraph for, according to some members, it was superfluous. During the discussions that followed, it was stated that this paragraph deals with cases where an airline is unable to exercise its rights and where another airline would like to increase its quota, and cases where all airlines exercise this right but then increased traffic does not make it necessary to establish an additional frequency for each one of them. It was therefore resolved that:

- the number of services should not be specified so as to conform to the preceding paragraphs;

- this paragraph be recast by introducing the notion of a commercial agreement solely in the event where an airline operates traffic exceeding its quota.

Paragraph 5

27. During consideration of this paragraph, it was stated that a third possibility namely, the compensation in kind for the fifth freedom such as training, equipment supply etc... was lacking. The committee felt that this notion should not be included even though it has already been discussed within AFCAC. It concluded its debates by requesting that this paragraph be recast so as to incorporate on the one hand, the possibility to mutually exchange the fifth freedom, and, on the other hand, the possibility to compensate with advantages of air transport economy where reciprocity is inexistent.

Paragraph 7

28. The committee proposed that this paragraph be deleted since cancellation measures will figure in the text of commercial agreements.

Model multilateral air transport agreement among African States

29. This draft agreement was considered article by article and the following remarks were made:

Article 1

According to the Committee, it would be necessary to:

1. add "privileges granted ... to airports used exclusively for military purposes" to the last paragraph;

2. delete the word military in the last line which will thus read: "... to the approval of the competent authorities".

Section 3

30. It was resolved that the number of services should not be mentioned.

Section 7

31. The committee requested that impose be replaced by establish and imposed by established.

Section 8

32. It was requested that this paragraph be recast taking account of the possibility to designate not only an enterprise but, possibly, enterprises if the case arises.

Article 4

Section 1

33. Discussions were centred on reasons that led authors of the text to provide for reservations only on the fifth freedom. Some members suggested that it be deleted. Explanations furnished revealed that that was a flexible measure introduced so as to win more support.

34. The committee's view on this issue was divergent since some members supported its deletion while the majority requested that it be maintained without any amendment.

Section 3

35. It was accepted that this section was out of place and that it should be placed at the end of the text.

36. With regard to its content, the committee requested the following addition: "if both parties fail to agree, the President of AFCAC shall nominate a third arbitrator"

Article 7

Sections 6 and 7

37. It was requested that "and/or AFCAC" be added at the end of both sections.

Article 8

38. For purposes of a better understanding of the text, it was suggested that the definitions should come at the beginning of the agreement.

39. After considering both documents, one representative stated that the text of the multilateral agreement does not contain such points as the transfer of funds, agreement on mutual tax exemption and the exemption granted to warehouses, for instance.

40. It was finally mentioned that the text of the multilateral agreement did not consider traffic rights and that it would be necessary to prepare a multilateral agreement on other points since they figure in the committee's mandate.

Problems to be solved prior to the creation of subregional airlines (agenda item 4)

41. Two working documents had been prepared on this item. They were DEC/TRANSCOM/AIR/19, and DEC/TRANSCOM/AIR/19/Add.1, prepared by ECA and AFCAC respectively.

42. A representative of ECA introduced the document DEC/TRANSCOM/AIR/19 and said that although the first conference on air transport in Africa, organized by ECA and ICAO in 1964, had recommended the creation of sub-regional airlines, to date no success had been recorded. The main stumbling blocks were four, and they were:

(a) considerations of the prestige attached to the flying of the national flag by a national carrier;

(b) resistance by managers of existing national airlines who fear loss of power in a centralized subregional airline;

(c) the feeling by countries that a national carrier is a symbol of their sovereignty; and

(d) the difference in the size of African airlines which makes it difficult for them to decide to merge.

43. The ECA representative suggested that in order to overcome past difficulties a fresh approach ought to be attempted and this should consist of the following actions:

(a) identifying those airlines or States that wished to create a sub-regional airline;

(b) conducting a study on the creation of such an airline; and

(c) establishing, as the first step, co-operative arrangements such as pooling of services and resources and joint operations.

44. Document DEC/TRANSCOM/AIR/19/Add.1 was introduced by a representative of AFCAC who recalled that at the beginning of 1981 a meeting had been organized

among several organizations, including AFCAC, OAU, ECA, AFRAA, ICAO, IATA and ITA to look into the problem of the creation of multi-national airlines. One of the outcomes of the meeting was a project document for a feasibility study on the creation of a pan-African airline. Unfortunately to date no funding had been secured for the study.

45. The paper prepared by AFCAC sought to advance the issue by making specific proposals for action to be taken. Certainly, the justification of maintaining a national airline for reasons of prestige and pride was not valid. Having outline the major problems to be solved, he suggested that the objective should be to create structures for negotiations on the creation of sub-regional airlines, in the short term, and a pan-African airline in the long term. In that connextion, future work of AFCAC's panel of legal experts included the following tasks:

(a) consideration of all legal aspects in connection with the establishment of multi-national airlines;

(b) development of a model agreement for the establishment of multi-national airlines;

(c) the development of a model air transport agreement to be used in negotiations with third States.

He concluded by making the following recommendations for future action.

(i) that African States and airlines wishing to co-operate in the creation of subregional airlines should be identified;

(ii) ECA should consider providing financial assistance to AFCAC for a feasibility study on the creation of a pan-African airline as well as funding other AFCAC activities related to the improvement of air transport in Africa including providing AFCAC Secretariat with a data processing system for research and studies.

46. In the ensuing debate, the Chairman suggested that the committee should address itself to the recommendations of ECA and AFCAC, which were more or less the same. He, however, felt that the question of ECA providing AFCAC with funds for a data processing system was outside the scope of the agenda item.

47. A number of committee members took the floor on the issue to welcome the realistic approach proposed in the recommendations; particularly, the suggestions that the creation of sub-regional airlines culminating in a pan-African airline should be done on a step by step basis and that it should be confined only to States and airlines needing to create sub-regional airlines as some of the bigger airlines may not feel the need for such an endeavour. The first step, therefore, would be the identification of such airlines to be followed by a comprehensive feasibility study touching on all the important questions to be addressed, such as legal questions, financial consideration and the economic viability of the enterprise. The study should also look into such questions as whether the creation of a sub-regional airline would lead to the disappearance of national airline and, if not, what the relationship between the latter and the sub-regional airline would be.

48. The Chairman summarized the discussions by pointing out that the mandate from African Heads of State had existed for some time and all that remained was for the Committee to spell out the modalities for carrying it out. The Committee supported the recommendation that ECA should undertake surveys to determine the States more likely to want to cooperate towards the creation of a multinational airline and once that was done, the Committee could then look into the question of financing feasibility studies. It was also understood that, while the responsibility for the surveys was entrusted to ECA, it was expected that, as usual, ECA would collaborate with other organization as necessary.

49. The Chief of the Transport, Communications and Tourism Division of ECA said that the undertaking of surveys by ECA would be a relatively easy matter as some of the subregions that were interested were already known such as those served by the Economic Community of the Great Lakes States (CEPGL) and the Preferential Trade Area for Eastern and Southern Africa (PTA).

ECA/WORLD BANK/UNDP project on transport development South of the Sahara: (Agenda item 5)

50. Under this agenda item ECA presented the document DEC/TRANSCOM/AIR/21.

51. In giving the background to the document, the ECA representative explained that the project was initiated as a result of the World Bank's approach to ECA to jointly undertake studies on the transport systems in Sub-Saharan Africa. The documents which the World Bank had submitted to ECA on the subject had to be revised, after consultation with such competent organisations as AFCAC, to include Air Transport in any major activities of the World Bank in Africa South of the Sahara.

52. It was emphasised in the meeting that this was so because Air Transport was lagging far behind in Africa than in the other Regions despite the fact that several documents and discussions in the various fora had identified the problems and possible solutions of developing this mode of transport. Air Transport was therefore not playing a major role in the development of the continent as expected. It was in this context that ECA suggested that workshops and studies be undertaken in the following areas :

I. Development of Air Services

II. Development of Airports and Navigation facilities.

Under item I, the subjects to be considered would be:

(a) Management improvement;

(b) Co-operation and co-ordination;

(c) Choice and financing of aircraft - organization of maintenance systems;

(d) Facilitation of Air Transport services.

53. With regard to item II, the workshop would discuss the findings of a study on the development of airports and navigation facilities particularly the structure and the management of these facilities.

54. It was made clear that the activities under this project were not intended to replace the on-going projects or activities but rather to supplement them. ie to close any gaps that may exist.

55. After lengthy discussion on this agenda item, it was generally felt that the World Bank was taking a positive attitude with regard to the development of Air Transport in Africa. It was now seen that Air Transport was not a luxury in Africa but rather as being essential for the socio-economic development and integration of the continent.

56. The committee also felt that although not everyone was consulted about the project, the competent people and organisations in the Air Transport field had been consulted about the project and in future the Technical Committee on Air Transport in Africa would be closely consulted and associated with the project. Already three members of the Committee had been nominated to be members of the projects Technical Committee. These members were: the Chairman of the Regional Technical Committee on Air Transport in Africa, the President of AFCAC and the Secretary General of AFCAC.

57. The Committee noted that the project was being funded by UNDP and the World Bank was the lead Agency and ECA the Associate Agency of the project. The Committee also noted that there was a management team consisting of the World Bank and ECA. The team was responsible to finalize the documents and to be responsible for the technical aspects of the project.

58. In concluding the deliberations on this agenda item the Committee recommended that:

(i) African experts and organisations should as much as possible be used in the execution of the project. These experts know the conditions prevailing in Africa;

(ii) Since African organisations will remain in Africa, these should preferably be used since they will be able to follow up activities in this field;

(iii) The Regional Technical Committee on Air Transport in Africa should closely be involved in the project;

(iv) The Organisations already involved in existing projects such as ADB should continue to do so but they should also be involved in this project;

(v) Although more information on the project was necessary the project should proceed as in any case the workshops should provide the needed information.

59. The Committee also approved the appointment of three of its members to the project's Technical Committee.

60. The Committee commended ECA's participation in the realisation of this project and then encouraged it to continue its efforts.

Planning of the technical committee's activities, taking into account objectives of the Mbabane Declaration (Agenda item 6)

61. Document DEC/TRANSCOM/AIR/20 was introduced by the ECA representative who specified that the committee should make suggestions on activities that will make it possible to prepare a programme of work.

62. During discussions that followed members of the committee unanimously agreed that it was correct to group tasks under four subjects.

63. On the other hand, the Secretariat was requested to prepare a more detailed planning of activities which will be sent to all members of the committee before the next meeting, for consideration and advisory opinion. Members of the committee will be expected to answer within the time-limit that will be set.

Draft policy-statement on air transport in Africa (Agenda item 7)

64. The Committee was unable to consider agenda item 7 because it did not receive the document that AFRAA had to prepare and because the AFRAA representative failed to attend the meeting.

Other business (Agenda item 8)

65. The committee received no question under this agenda item.

Date and venue of the next meeting (Agenda item 9)

66. Members of the committee wished that future meetings be organized in all subregions so as to enable all African States to know their various activities. This would make it possible to ensure the promotion of the committee, its set objectives and the activities it is carrying out.

67. Morocco was requested to host the next meeting in November 1987. Morocco will confirm this after consulting the competent authorities.

68. If Morocco fails to host the next meeting, then it will be held at the ECA headquarters in Addis Ababa.

69. The committee further requested that the planning of its future meetings be established so as to enable countries chosen to prepare at the right time.

Adoption of the report and closure of the meeting (agenda item 10)

70. The meeting adopted its report after a few amendments.

71. Following adoption of the report, the Chairman called upon the Chief, ECA Transport, Communications and Tourism Division, to deliver the message he wanted to communicate to the committee.

72. The Chief, ECA Transport, Communications and Tourism Division first said he was happy to see members of the Committee once more in Addis and to note that they had African air transport development problems at heart. He then stated that an exhaustive evaluation of the transport and communications Decade will soon start and that the Mbabane Declaration will figure amongst the Decade's achievements. He concluded by stating that the Committee has a vital role to play in the Decade's evaluation.

73. In closing the meeting, the Chairman of the Committee thanked ECA and the OAU for the efforts made and Committee members for their close collaboration which led to the full success of the meeting.

ND

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL

Distr.: LIMITED

E/ECA/TRANS/49
29 June 1987

ENGLISH
Original: FRENCH

LC/NAIROBI

ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR AFRICA (ECA)

UNION OF AFRICAN RAILWAYS (UAR)

REPORT OF THE WORKSHOP ON RAILWAY TRACK MAINTENANCE, REPAIR AND RENEWAL

Addis Ababa (Ethiopia) 15-17 June 1987

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
A.	INTRODUCTION	1
B.	ATTENDANCE AND PARTICIPATION	1
C.	OPENING OF THE WORKSHOP	1
D.	SUMMARY OF STATEMENTS AND DISCUSSIONS	4
E.	RECOMMENDATIONS	10
F.	CLOSURE OF THE WORKSHOP	11

ANNEXES

I.	DOCUMENTS PRESENTED	1
II.	EVALUATION OF THE WORKSHOP BY THE PARTICIPANTS	1
III.	ECA/UAR OBSERVATIONS ON THE WORKSHOP AS A WHOLE AND THE EVALUATION BY THE PARTICIPANTS	1
IV.	LIST OF PARTICIPANTS	1

A. Introduction

1. The workshop on track maintenance, repair and renewal, organised jointly by the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (ECA) and the Union of African Railways (UAR) was held in Addis Ababa (Ethiopia) from 15 to 17 June 1987 at ECA Headquarters, Africa Hall.

B. Attendance and Participation

2. Representatives from the following railways participated in the Workshop:

- Société nationale des transports ferroviaires - SNTF, Algéria;
- Chemin de Fer Congo-Océan - CFCO, Congo;
- Egyptian National Railways - ENR, Egypt;
- Chemin de fer Djibouto-Ethiopien CFD-Ethiopia/Djibouti;
- Kenya Railways - KR, Kenya;
- Régie des chemins de fer du Mali - RCFM, Mali;
- Société Nationale des Chemins de fer du Zaïre - SNCZ, Zaïre.

C. Opening of the Workshop (agenda item 1)

3. The opening session was presided over by the Deputy Executive Secretary of ECA, assisted by the UAR Vice-Chairman for East Africa.

4. The workshop was opened by Mr. Tchouta Moussa, Deputy Executive Secretary of ECA who welcomed the participants and went on to stress the importance of the workshop which should be viewed as part of the activities of the United Nations Transport and Communications Decade in Africa. He placed special emphasis on the points mentioned below.

The workshop had been planned a long time ago since the need for it became apparent during consideration of the Decade's railway projects and during the technical assistance missions undertaken by the ECA railway expert to various railway networks. ECA had prepared, within the framework of the Decade's activities, a series of outlines for studies of projects, particularly, track-related projects which were the most in number. During his missions on aspects of railway management, the railway expert had observed certain inadequacies in the management of track operations. These various considerations proved that the workshop was timely and necessary.

In selecting the themes to be discussed by the workshop, the nature of the activities covered by the UAR Permanent Way Committee and ECA's experience in certain areas of railway management were taken into account. This was why ECA had been asked to deal with problems of cost allocation, efficiency ratios and regulations while UAR was expected to explain the technical issues because of its experience in this field.

The workshop would also tackle themes that had been discussed on previous occasions. However, the fact that they were constantly being raised definitely indicated a desire for progress and responded to the need for continuing training.

Lastly, the workshop was introducing a new form of fruitful co-operation between UAR and ECA. The Deputy Executive Secretary concluded his statement by wishing the Workshop success in its deliberations.

5. On behalf of UAR, Mr. T. Tchanné Tamerou, UAR Vice-Chairman for East Africa and Director-General of the Djibouti-Ethiopian Railways, welcomed the participants in his turn, and paid a reverent tribute to the Head of State of Socialist Ethiopia, His Excellency Chairman Menghistu Haile Mariam and to the Government and people of Ethiopia for the constant support the UAR had always received from them in its pursuit of the objectives assigned to it.

He explained that the workshop was organised under the regular programme of meetings of ECA and UAR and mentioned the themes that would be presented by the different lecturers on various aspects of management and track maintenance, repair and renewal techniques.

He underscored the financial problems facing UAR at the moment and commended the UAR staff who, notwithstanding the constraints, had made enormous sacrifices and were willing and determined to pursue the difficult but exalting task entrusted to them by the African railway authorities.

In conclusion, he wished the workshop every success.

6. Following the statement by the UAR Vice-Chairman, the ECA Deputy Executive Secretary officially declared the workshop open.

Election of Officers (Agenda item 2)

7. On the proposal of the UAR General Secretariat, the following officers were elected:

Chairman - Chemins de Fer Djibouto-Ethiopien CFD.

1st Vice-Chairman - Société Nationale des Transports Ferroviaires - SNTF.

2nd Vice-Chairman - Kenya Railways KR.

Rapporteurs - ECA and UAR.

Adoption of the agenda and organization of work (agenda item 3)

8. The following agenda was adopted:

1. Opening of the workshop

   (a) Statement by the ECA Deputy Executive Secretary;

   (b) Statement by the UAR Vice-Chairman

2. Election of Officers

3. Adoption of the agenda and organization of work

4. Workshop paper No. 1 by the ECA representative on "Criteria for distinguishing between investment expenditure and track maintenance and renewal expenses for statistical and cost accounting purposed".

5. Communication by the CFCO delegate on "Track renewal and maintenance".

6. Workshop paper No. 2 by the ECA representative on: "Management information on mechanized and manual track maintenance and renewal methods. Follow-up of maintenance operations".

7. Communication by the RCFM delegate on: "Track maintenance mechanization at the Régie des Chemins de Fer du Mali (RCFM) and at the Régie des Chemins de Fer Abidjan/Niger (RAN).

8. Workshop paper No. 3 by the ECA representative on: "Basic regulations on track maintenance and renewal".

9. Any other business.

10. Adoption of the report and closure of the workshop.

9. The programme of work was adopted without amendment.

10. The delegates simply requested that papers available in French and English should not be read in order to leave more time for discussion of the proposed themes. This would make the workshop more lively and more productive.

11. The delegates also expressed the hope that recommendations would be made at the end of the dicussion on each of the papers presented.

12. Following the adoption of the agenda and programme of work, the ECA and UAR representatives explained the reasons that had prompted the holding of the workshop and the style that was to mark its development.

13. The representative of ECA spoke about the organization and proceedings of the workshop as well as the subsequent follow-up.

The organization of this workshop ushered in a new form of co-operation between ECA and UAR with ECA concentrating on management problems while UAR took care of technical matters.

The proceedings of the workshop would be characterized by the use of the participative method whereby the specialists presenting the papers acted as discussion leaders. There would be two types of evaluation: evaluation by the participants and evaluation by the organisers and discussion leaders.

The follow-up of the workshop would be initiated by ECA and UAR which, within a period of six months, would request the railways represented at the workshop to provide information on their application of the workshop's recommendations.

14. The UAR representative commented briefly on the papers being presented by the railway delegates. They were mainly technical papers relating the experiences of the railways under consideration. During the debates, it would be worthwhile comparing the experiences of other railways and recommendations made would help to consolidate the procedures and harmonize the methods used.

These papers contained full and well-researched information on recent examples of the development of methods and techniques utilized by the railways concerned and the ensuing discussions should facilitate the formulation of practical recommendations for all railways.

The debates of the workshop whose hallmark was efficiency ought to be held in this spirit.

D. Summary of Statements and Discussions, Workshop Paper No. 1 by ECA Representative (agenda item 4)

15. The first paper introduced by the representative of ECA dealt with criteria for distinguishing between investment expenditure and track maintenance and renewal expenses for statistical and cost accounting purposes. The aim of the paper was to demonstrate, in general, the need to adopt the principle of using railway tariff revenue to finance renewals considered part of operating expenses. An analysis of the current accounting methods showed that they were neither strict enough nor did they differentiate between renewals and investments. In fact, renewal expenses were incurred to maintain the production capacity of an establishment at a constant level while investment expenditure aimed at increasing that capacity.

Recommendations had been made on the evaluation of renewal expenses and the modalities of cost allocation. Logical criteria for distinguishing between investment expenditure and renewal expenses should be adopted, if possible, in the form of international standards, and the tariff policy should ensure that renewal expenses are financed from railway tariff revenue.

The difficulties encountered in this area by railways were well known; however, the subject deserved a great deal of thought and making the right decisions would go a long way to improve railway management.

16. The statement by the ECA representative was followed by a lengthy and lively discussion among all the delegations present.

Observations were made mainly on the difficulties encountered by the railways in classifying maintenance and renewal expenses for accounting purposes. These difficulties usually impeded adherence to any planned programmes and were recognized as a basically major problem. A general consensus was reached on the need to formulate recommendations aimed at: better preparation of the cost accounting plan for railway operating expenses; the adoption of a precise terminology for track renewal and maintenance operations; and the definition of criteria and ratios denoting the quantity and quality of the job performed during such operations.

Communication by the CFCO delegate (agenda item 5)

17. Owing to the increase in the traffic of goods and minerals, and, the frequent occurrence of railway incidents due to railway tracks, the Congo-Ocean railways (CFCO) was compelled to plan and carry out works to improve the carrying capacity of the superstructure and ensure the safe movement of trains.

Given the limited financial resources, improvements were made only on those sections with very heavy traffic and in such poor condition as to jeopardize the safety of the trains.

Besides the regular maintenance the network carried out renewal operations for the replacement of rails, sleepers, ballast as well as complete renewal of the track.

Most of these activities were performed by track maintenance gangs assisted by temporary workers. However, complete renewal operations were gradually mechanized in conformity with the current mechanization programme launched by the Agency.

Increased mechanization during the execution of works carried out by the railway establishment yielded satisfactory results and improved the time-period for the execution of works.

Unfortunately there could not be full mechanization since procurement of the proper machinery called for sizeable investments and this was not possible considering the current financial situation. The problem could be solved within the framework of the interconnections recommended by UAR. It would therefore be in our networks' interest to contribute actively to the implementation of the relevant programmes.

18. All the delegations took part in the pertinent and fruitful discussions that followed the communication by the CFCO delegate. Those discussions highlighted the various technical problems relating to track maintenance and renewal: rail lubrication methods, rail welding techniques, comparison of manual renewals carried out under railway supervision and mechanized renewals carried out by contractors, time-periods allotted for the performance of track operations, conditions for the use of a ballast-scarifier and screening machine and the realignment of curves by using the geometrical method.

The relevant explanations provided by the CFCO delegate made it possible to evaluate the quality of the maintenance and renewal methods used by the CFCO Railway.

19. The CFCO delegate also spoke of the efforts made and difficulties encountered by his railways to apply that portion of the cost accounting plan relating to track maintenance. Today, there was proper management of maintenance because of the results obtained. The documents on the methodology applied would be communicated to UAR and ECA.

Workshop Paper No. 2 by the ECA representative (agenda item 6)

20. The second paper presented by the ECA representative, concerned management information on track renewal and maintenance methods and the problem of utilization of mechanization and manpower. The aim of this paper was to draw the participants' attention to the need to have management information in these areas. Of course such information would differ depending on whether operations were labour-intensive or capital-intensive. In order to guide the choice of information, the cycle of maintenance operations was described for each method of maintenance used.

In the case of maintenance and renewal, the participants' attention was drawn to:

- the need to devise statistical and accounting models for the processing of data;

- the advisability of adopting a specific method of cost calculation.

The ECA representative concluded that it was necessary to compile a whole range of management information in order to facilitate decison-making on management. Such management information would emanate from the methods currently utilized by certain railways.

21. The annex to workshop paper No. 2 should be considered an example of management information on track maintenance. It contained various types of follow-up track maintenance operations.

The follow-up consisted in an immediate inspection of such operations and the recording of data according to accounting and statistical methods. Standards were proposed for the classification of types of operations while notions of efficiency were also reviewed. The document underscored the need to analyse results in order to improve management methods.

Such follow-up could be done during inspection tours by track maintenance gangs or heads of sections and possibly with the use of track examination equipment.

The follow-up of time spent by the personnel should relate to clearly defined activities. Work yields could be calculated and the results obtained would be compared with the efficiency indicators determined on the basis of experience.

The follow-up of spare parts and materials would make it easier to estimate supplies.

In any case, the document was only an example and participants were invited to formulate recommendations and proposals.

22. The statement by the ECA representative was followed by a lively debate. Practically all the delegations took the floor to explain the situation prevailing in their respective railways.

It was suggested that UAR adopt a uniform terminology to designate the various types of maintenance and renewal operations.

23. Some railways used evaluation criteria and significant ratios to assess the quality and quantity of output. One railway representative mentioned the existence of a "spread sheet" where such results and indices were recorded. Specific maintenance and renewal operations costs were calculated only by few railways. The workshop hoped that accounting and statistical models as well as specific cost calculation methods based on experiences of some of the railways, would be defined by UAR. Recommendations would be made along those lines.

24. The problem of the "programme-calendar" was stressed. The programme-calendar currently used at the railways provided useful information. However, it did not permit accurate evaluation of operations required for maintaining tracks in good condition. It was suggested that UAR give serious consideration to the problem in order to establish standards that would facilitate a reformulation of some of the basic components of the programme calendar so that the latter could become a complete and effective working tool.

Communication by the RCFM Delegate (agenda item 3)

25. Railway tracks should never be neglected, not even for one instant. The slightest distortion could cause extensive damage to equipment and become worse if not attended immediately. This was why a sound maintenance policy was necessary. The paper described the composition, situation and equipment for track maintenance operations at RCFM and RAN.

African networks had developed to a stage where manual maintenance had to give way to rational mechanized maintenance. The aim of mechanized maintenance was to carry out all the basic operations required to maintain the homogeneity of the constituent parts of the track so as to ensure maximum safety. Mechanization made it possible to rationalize the operations to be carried out and obtain a good track with a stable track bed, proper lay out, stock and fastenings in good condition, good levelling and good re-alignment.

The two networks used a combination of mechanized and manual maintenance for several reasons, in particular, the availability of cheap labour and shortage of financial resources to acquire the proper machinery. On the other hand, railway officials' constant desire to enhance efficiency was leading them to introduce mechanized track maintenance in order to improve the quality of service, modernize track renewal and maintenance techniques and relieve the staff of the more arduous tasks.

The pre-conditions for mechanization of track maintenance were:

1. Adequate ballasting of tracks: a ballast profile as close as possible to the prescribed standard so as to allow effective use of mechanized equipment;

2. Training of staff to operate and service the machines;

3. Availability of minimum facilities (workshop for example) for the servicing of equipment;

4. Considerable traffic density (train, tonnage, speed, frequency) causing the track to deteriorate to such an extent that procurement of machinery was necessary in order to obtain a reasonable hourly yield within a relatively short space of time;

5. Adequate network density (length of lines open to traffic) - although not a determining factor, could necessitate mechanized maintenance;

6. A genuine will to modernize track maintenance policy;

7. Track equipment in satisfactory condition.

The various machines and types of mechanization were enumerated in the RCFM paper which also provided some information on the practical organizatioin of mechanized maintenance, particularly, as regards structure and staff, programmes of mechanized maintenance and the advantages of mechanized packing as compared to manual packing.

In conclusion, mechanized track maintenance policy should aim at the gradual replacement of man by the machine without excessive spending.

26. The summary of the paper by the RCFM delegate was followed most attentively and elicited pertinent statements from the representatives of SNFT, CFCO, Kenya Railways and SNCZ in particular. The discussions revealed that some railways had experienced certain difficulties in mechanizing track maintenance operations (packing, for instance) while others had obtained conclusive results in that area.

The problems of mechanization should be approached with caution even if it were obvious that mechanization constituted progress to which all railways should aspire. Mechanization should not be carried out in isolated actions but should rather form part of a global policy providing effective and economical conditions.

Some networks had mechanized equipment for track renewal and maintenance. Recent experience had shown that the rental of such equipment to private national or foreign firms could help to make it pay.

A recommendation on this issue was deemed necessary. To guide its member railways, UAR should define criteria setting forth the best conditions for the achievement of mechanization adapted to the specific characteristics of African railway networks.

Workshop Paper No. 3 by the ECA Representative (agenda item 8)

27. In workshop paper No. 3, the ECA railway expert tackled basic regulations on track maintenance and renewal and recalled the fundamental role of regulations which made it possible to:

- define general and specific tasks;

- assign responsibilities to departments and employees;

- participate in the training of staff.

The regulations were also classified into:

- normative - general regulations;

- operative - concerning procedures documents.

A general observation was made on the inadequacy of existing regulations which were often ill-adapted and outdated. It was imperative for railway officials who were aware of this problem to decide to resolve it. This was a difficult task which had to be performed on a continous basis.

The arguments contained in workshop paper No. 3 were obviously applicable to all regulations but the problem of track regulations was particularly delicate.

This workshop should provide some answers to this basic problem which was well-known to all.

28. During the debate that followed the ECA representative's presentation, the delegations present spoke about the state of their railway regulations. Railway officials were aware of the magnitude of the problem, said the delegates who informed the workshop of the measures that had been taken in that connection. At the instance of the heads of the railway departments concerned, considerable and rewarding efforts had been made in this area by the ad hoc committees set up. On the whole, the delegates felt that this was a major problem which should be resolved in several successive stages as far as both the general regulations and procedures documents were concerned. One delegate pointed out that in the case of his railways, owing to the establishment of a single network system, it was very difficult to formulate proper regulations. Another delegate mentioned the lack of documentation to help officials in the drafting of suitable and effective regulations that were adapted to the characteristics of each railway network.

It was deemed necessary to draft a general recommendation on the establishement and improvement of appropriate general regulations defining the standards, principles and operative rules specifying the various jobs to be done.

Any other business (Agenda item 9)

29. Under this item, the ECA representative announced that a co-operation agreement between ECA and UAR was to be signed soon.

The co-operation agreement between ECA and UAR would stipulate in particular that representatives of the two institutions would meet from time to time to work out details of activities to be undertaken mainly for the purpose of assisting UAR and the railway networks, it being understood that the final decision would rest with the UAR, a specialized agency of OAU.

E. Recommendations (agenda item 10)

30. The following recommendations were put forward by the participants:

1. The networks should have a cost accounting manual covering all items under "Way and works";

This responsibility was entrusted to the UAR Technical Committee with the support of ECA.

2. A study providing efficiency indicators and production cost indices for track renewal and maintenance was indispensable to networks;

The UAR was asked to prepare this study in collaboration with ECA.

3. The problem of intervals for track operations should be re-examined in terms of present-day realities, the Networks' resources and new techniques;

UAR was entrusted with this study.

4. The UAR Technical Committee should pay special attention to the rewording of the programme-calendar to ensure that the budgetary estimate is as realistic as possible;

5. UAR was requested to seek ways and means of standardizing the terminology used by the various Networks;

6. Statistical and cost calculation methods were indispensable to the Networks and UAR should carry out the relevant studies in collaboration with ECA.

7. The UAR Technical Committee was asked to determine the general criteria to be strictly observed in studies conducted with a view to mechanizing track maintenance and renewal operations.

8. In general, the delegates suggested that rental of network machinery to contracting firms should be taken into account when seeking solutions to the problems of profitability of heavy maintenance machinery.

9. It was recommended that Networks do their utmost to acquire regulations that were well-adapted to their characteristics and needs.

F. Closure of the Workshop

31. The closing session of the workshop began with a communication by the rapporteurs on the evaluation of the workshop (see annexes 2 and 3 attached). The representative of ECA and the Vice-Chairman of UAR delivered statements of thanks.

The workshop was then declared closed by the ECA representative.

Documents submitted

Documents submitted by ECA

TRANSCOM/26 - Criteria for distinguishing between investment expenditure and track maintenance and renewal expenses for statistical and cost accounting purposes.

TRANSCOM/27 - Management information on mechanized and manual track maintenance and renewal methods.

Annex - Follow-up track maintenance operations.

TRANSCOM/28 - Basic regulations on track maintenance and renewal.

Documents submitted by UAR

TRANSCOM/112 "Mechanization of track maintenance in the Régie des Chemins de Fer Abidjan/Niger (RAN and Régie des chemins de fer du Mali (RCFM).

TRANSCOM/114 - Track maintenance and renewal (Agence Transcongolaise des communications. ATC - Chemin de Fer Congo - Océan - CFCO.

Evaluation of the Workshop By the Participants

A workshop evaluation form was distributed to the participants. On the whole, all the delegations answered the questions in the form. The 24 replies received and the comments made are mentioned below.

1. Duration of the workshop

The duration was considered "just right" by some and "too short" by others.

2. Daily schedule

It was considered "just right" by practically all the participants.

3. Content of the workshop in terms of meeting the participant's needs

Half of the participants felt that the content met their needs "to a sufficient extent", a number of them felt their expectations had been fulfilled to a "very large" or to a "large extent".

4. Level of the workshop

It was considered "adequate" by all the participants. Delegates deplored the small number of railways represented as this had affected the exchange of ideas.

5. Subjects considered of interest

Many participants expressed the hope that the mechanization and management problems would be actively followed up.

6. Subjects that were not dealt with or were inadequately covered

Half of the participants felt that the subjects proposed had been "adequately covered". Other subjects were suggested: maintenance of structural works for instance.

7. Suggestions of changes for improvement of the workshop

Some participants felt that the time allocated for discussions should have been longer, and the duration of the workshop could have been extended.

8. Balance between lectures and discussions

The balance was considered "just right" for a workshop.

9. Presentation of papers and ability to deal with the subjects

Nearly all the participants considered the presentation and ability to deal with the subjects "good" or "excellent".

10. Exchange of views with the lecturers and fellow participants

On this point, the participants' appraisal was either "good" or "very good".

11. Usefulness of the workshop, professionally

Nearly all the participants agreed that the workshop was professionally beneficial.

12 Application of knowledge acquired during the workshop

The replies to this question varied a great deal. Half of the participants felt that they would have an opportunity of applying many of the measures recommended.

13. Organization of similar workshops

All the participants hoped that similar workshops would be organized.

14. General comments

The participants considered the workshop interesting and beneficial as a whole.

ECA/UAR Comments on the Workshop as a Whole and on the Participants' Evaluation of the Workshop

The organizers (ECA/UAR) and the discussion leaders were required to comment on the workshop as a whole and on the participants' evaluation of the workshop. The replies and comments are referred to below.

1. Attendance

Attendance was very good as far as the number of delegates was concerned but very poor when it came to the number of railways represented.

On the whole, the group was homogeneous.

2. Preparation

The delegates from participating networks showed that they were highly conversant with the subjects dealt with by the workshop.

3. Discussions of the workshop

The discussions were considered excellent, lively and interesting. The participants put life into them.

4. Recommendations

Many judicious recommendations were made thus proving the participants' awareness of the various problems.

5. Final impression

Despite the small number of networks represented, the workshop was held under excellent conditions and participation in the discussions was intensive.

Lastly, the workshop was interesting and beneficial.

LISTE DES PARTICIPANTS/LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

I. Delegates of Member Networks of the Union of African Railways

1. Société Nationale des Transports ferroviaires (SNTF)

Mr. MEKREBI Abdelkader
Directeur des infrastructures
SNTF-Algeria

Mr. BOULKEDID Djamel
Directeur INFRAFER
Algeria

2. Agence Transcongolaise des Communications (ATC/CFCO)

Mr. KOUTOUNDOU Jacques
Chef de Service Voie et Bâtiments
Congo

3. Régie du Chemin de fer du Mali (RCFM)

Mr. CISSE Hamadoun Assoumane
Chef de Service Voie et Bâtiments
Régie du Chemin de fer du Mali

4. Société Nationale des Chemins de fer Zaïrois (SNCZ)

Mr. NGULU-KIAMA
Directeur du Département des
Installations Fixes
Zaire

5. Kenya Railways (KR)

Mr. FERDINAND CALIST CHAMI
Principal Enginneer (Way & Works)
Kenya

6. Chemin de fer Djibouto-Ethiopien

Mr. TCHANNIE TAMEROU
Directeur Général

Mr. H.I. OUBECHE
Député Directeur Général

Mr. MOHAMED FARAH Badar
Directeur Technique

Mr. WOLDE GIORGIS Assefa
Technical Advisor

Mr. IBRAHIM ABDOULAHI
Chef de Division Voie et Bâtiments

Mr. IBRAHIM DJAMA
Chef de la Division MT

Mr. ASSEFA KASSAE
Inspecteur Voie et Bâtiments

Mr. TESHOME WOLDE G.
Inspecteur Voie et Bâtiments

Mr. GUERMA ZELEQUE
Chef Departement Formation et Recrutement

Mr. IDRISS ABDELLAH
Chef Section Formation

Mr. TEZERA TEGUEGNE
Chef de Bureau d'études

Mr. ELMI AFASSE DIRIE
C.S. Djibouti

Mr. JOSEPH PETROS
Chef Section Voie

Mr. GUERE WELDE NEGATOU
Chef Section Voie

Mr. GUETATCHEOU Tadesse
Chef Section Voie

Mr. YEMANE BEREHE
Chef de District

Mr. MELKAMOU KEBEDE
Chef de District

Mr. AHMED OMAR
Chef de District

Mr. KAMIL DIRANE HARED
Chef District Bâtiments et
Ouvrages d'Arts

Mr. MOULOUGUETTA Zelcke
Chef de District

Mr. SOUFFIAM AHMED
Section Head

Mr. TEFERRA HAILE GUEBRIEL
Probationer

Mr. KEBEDE DJELDE
Ingénieur Voie

Mr. MULUGETTA-ZEWDE
Probationer (V.B)

Mr. OMAR HOUSSEIN ABDI
Civil Enginneering

Mr. TIGISTIE GEZAHEGS
Management Officer

7. Egyptian National Railways (ENR)

Mr. ABDALLA AHMED ABDALLA
Director of Track Maintenance
Egypt

8. UAR General Secretariat

Mr. GIRMA Woldeyes
Acting Technical Director
Union of African Railways
Kinshasa/l Zaire

Mr. NGUIMBI-MOULANGOU Benoît
Chief of Permanent Way
and Fixed Installations
Union of African Railways
Kinshasa/l Zaïre

9. ECA Secretariat

Mr. RUTAIWA Francis
OIC, Transport Communications &
Tourism Division

Mr. SOLIS Joseph
Railway Expert
Transport, Communications & Tourism Division

II. Organizations

10. OAU

Mr. HIZEKIEL Isaac
Chief of Transport
OAU

Mr. E.A. CHIMWAZA
Transport Economist
OAU

III. Diplomatic Missions

11. Congo

Mr. MAHOUNGOU Louis
Economic Counsellor
Embassy of Congo
Ethiopia

Guinea

Mr. DIALLO Seydi
First Secretary
Embassy of Guinea
Ethiopia

Senegal

Mr. WANE Birane B.F.
Counsellor
Senegalese Embassy
Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

IV. Observers

12. Mr. TCHANNE Tamerou
General Manager

Mr. H.I. OUBECHE
Dep. General Manager

Ms. FREHIOTTE ASRAT
Directeur financier

Mr. MENGISTU ZERIHUN
Directeur du Personnel

Mr. ZERIHOUN DEMISSIE
Chef de la Division I/C

Mr. DEMISSIE MAMO
Legal Advisor

Mr. ASSEFA ECHETOU
Chef du Service Audit

Mr. ABEBA G/GIORGIS
A/Purchassing & Store Division

Mr. SILESHI Shiferaw
Advisor to the General Manager

Mr. BELAYHUN MEKONNEN
Personnel Department Head

Mr. ALEM ABRAHA
Public Relations Head

V. Discussion Leades

13. Mr. KOUTOUNDOU Jacques, Chef du service voie et bâtiments
ATC/CFCO

Mr. CISSE HAMADOUN Assoumane, Chef du service voie et bâtiments,
RCFM

Mr. SOLIS Joseph
ECA Railway Expert